

**DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY
AIR QUALITY DIVISION
ACTIVITY REPORT: Scheduled Inspection**

N652633973

FACILITY: CMS Generation, Livingston Generating Station		SRN / ID: N6526
LOCATION: 155 N. Townline Road, GAYLORD		DISTRICT: Gaylord
CITY: GAYLORD		COUNTY: OTSEGO
CONTACT: Steve Ellison , Plant Operator		ACTIVITY DATE: 03/30/2016
STAFF: Becky Radulski	COMPLIANCE STATUS: Compliance	SOURCE CLASS: MAJOR
SUBJECT: scheduled site inspection and records review - the inspection was completed 3/30/16 when the facility was not operating. A follow up visit was made in order to see the units operating and monitors in 'live' mode on 9/18/16.		
RESOLVED COMPLAINTS:		

Traveled to N6526 CMS Generation Michigan Power LLC - Livingston Generating Station on March 30, 2016 and September 8, 2016 to conduct a Full Compliance Evaluation (FCE) FY16 scheduled inspection to determine compliance with MI-ROP-N16526-2014. The facility was viewed both times, however was not operating during the March 30 inspection, while 3 of 4 turbines were operating during the September 8 inspection.

Present for the inspections was Mr. Steve Ellison, Plant Operator. The facility is located at 155 North Townline Road, Gaylord, in Otsego County.

The facility is a peaking plant, which only operates when it is called up by Midcontinent Independent System Operator (MISO) during peak operating times. There are 4 Dresser-Ran natural gas turbine units, each with 2 engines. The turbines are equipped with water injection systems and are rated at 39 MW.

INSPECTION NOTES

MISO does not control the startup or shutdown of these turbines remotely, they are controlled onsite by the Operator. The engines are not black start capable. It is possible the facility may request to put in generators in the future to allow for black start.

The units were not operating during the site visit in March. 3 of the 4 units were operating during the September site visit (Units 1, 2 and 4 were operating, Unit 3 was offline). No visible emissions or odors were noted. There was noise directly at the facility, however it is off the road about ¼ mile, and no noise was noted at North Townline Road. Mr. Ellison indicated the units have been operating frequently since July.

Although the units are rated at 39 MW, they were tested at 33.5 MW; therefore they do not operate the units above 33.5 MW.

The turbine units are equipped with water injection systems to control NOx emissions – the water is injected to reduce temperatures, which reduces the formation of NOx. A water to fuel ratio is continuously calculated during operation. Each unit was tested during September 2012 to determine the appropriate water to fuel ratio range that the units must operate within to demonstrate compliance with NOx and CO limits. The control panel for each turbine was viewed in the control room. Each unit has a screen to monitor operating parameters. Above each monitor is posted the appropriate operating parameters for that turbine, including the water to fuel ratio range that was tested for that particular turbine.

REGULATORY DISCUSSION

The facility is subject to MI-ROP-N6526-2014, which was issued January 28, 2014. The facility has the potential to emit over 100 tons per year of each NOx and CO.

The facility is not major for HAPS.

Four combustion turbine units, EUCOMBTURB1, EUCOMBTURB2, EUCOMBTURB3, and EUCOMBTURB4 at the stationary source are subject to the New Source Performance Standards for Stationary Gas Turbines promulgated in 40 CFR, Part 60, Subparts A and GG.

EUCOMBTURB1, EUCOMBTURB2, EUCOMBTURB3, and EUCOMBTURB4 at the stationary source are subject to the federal Acid Rain program promulgated in 40 CFR, Part 72.

EUCOMBTURB1, EUCOMBTURB2, EUCOMBTURB3, and EUCOMBTURB4 at the stationary source were subject to the Clean Air Interstate Rule NO_x annual trading program pursuant to Rules 802a, 803, 821, and 830 through 834. CAIR expired in December 2014. Brian Carley, AQD, reopened the permit to incorporate applicable requirements associated with the Cross State Air Pollution Rule (CSAPR), compliance is determined by US EPA. The ROP revision was finalized June 16, 2016 with updated tables.

EUCOMBTURB1, EUCOMBTURB2, EUCOMBTURB3, and EUCOMBTURB4 at the stationary source were subject to the Clean Air Interstate Rule NO_x ozone season trading program pursuant to Rules 802a, 803 and 821 through 826. CAIR expired in December 2014. Brian Carley, AQD, reopened the permit to incorporate applicable requirements associated with the Cross State Air Pollution Rule (CSAPR), compliance is determined by US EPA. The ROP revision was finalized June 16, 2016 with updated tables.

EUCOMBTURB1, EUCOMBTURB2, EUCOMBTURB3, and EUCOMBTURB4 at the stationary source were subject to the Clean Air Interstate Rule SO₂ annual trading program pursuant to Rule 420. CAIR expired in December 2014. Brian Carley, AQD, reopened the permit to incorporate applicable requirements associated with the Cross State Air Pollution Rule (CSAPR), compliance is determined by US EPA. The ROP revision was finalized June 16, 2016 with updated tables.

FGCOMTURB SC III.1 as the following streamlined/subsumed requirement:

Streamlined Limit/ Requirement	Subsumed Limit/ Requirement	Stringency Analysis
Permittee shall burn only natural gas as defined in 40 CFR 60.331(u)	Permittee shall not burn natural gas containing more than 0.8 percent sulfur by weight, as required by 40 CFR 60.333(b)	Natural gas as defined by 40 CFR 60.331 (u) contains no more than 0.068% sulfur by weight, which is lower than the standard of 0.8 percent sulfur by weight in 40 CFR 60.333(b)

The facility is not subject to any Consent Order or Consent Judgements.

EUCOMBTURB1, EUCOMBTURB2, EUCOMBTURB3, and EUCOMBTURB4 are subject to Compliance Assurance Monitoring (CAM) for their NO_x limit in parts per million (SC I.1). Each emission unit uses water injection to lower the temperature which in turn lowers NO_x emissions. The facility uses a ratio of water injection to fuel burned as an indicator that the control is operating properly.

SPECIAL CONDITIONS AND RECORDS REVIEW

FGCOMBTURB (EUCOMBTURB1, EUCOMBTURB2, EUCOMBTURB3, and EUCOMBTURB4):

Emission Limits:

SC I.1, 2, 4 and 6 are determined by stack testing. The most recent stack test took place in June 2012 for EUCOMBTURB1, and September 2012 for EUCOMBTURB2, EUCOMBTURB3, and EUCOMBTURB4.

SC I.1 limits NO_x to 75 parts per million by volume at 15% oxygen on a dry basis, individually. Stack test results were reviewed and each EU is below the limit.

SC I.2 limits NO_x to 624.0 pounds/hour for FGTURBINE. Stack test results were reviewed and the

combined pounds/hour is below the limit.

SC I.3 limits NO_x to 224 tons/year for FGTURBINE, 12 month rolling. Records were viewed and facility and provided. NO_x emissions are 14.4 tons/12 month rolling.

SC I.4 limits CO to 0.487 pounds per million BTU heat input, individually. Stack test results were reviewed and each EU is below the limit.

SC I.5 limits CO to 844.0 pounds/hour for FGTURBINE. Stack test results were reviewed and each EU is below the limit.

SC I.6 limits CO to 224.0 tons/year for FGTURBINE, 12 month rolling. Records were viewed and facility and provided. CO emissions are 14.9 tons/12 month rolling.

Material Limits:

n/a

Process Operational Restrictions:

SC III.1 only natural gas is burned in the turbines. A fuel analysis was provided.

SC III.2 capacity factor must be under 10% averaged over 3 year period; annual capacity factor under 20% for calendar year. The capacity factors were provided – 3 year average is less than 10%; the annual capacity factor for the past calendar year was less than 20%.

SC III.3 must operate at % load, and water to fuel ratio as determined by stack testing. The facility operates within these parameters. Each turbine was tested at 33.5 MW instead of 39 MW max capable, therefore only operates at 33.5 MW. The facility monitors the water to fuel ratio, which is different for each turbine, and maintains operation within these ranges.

Design/Equipment Parameters:

SC IV.1 and IV.2 – must have a working injection system; must continuously monitor water to fuel ratio. The four combustion turbine units are equipped with a working water injection system, and a system to continuously monitor water to fuel ratio. Alarms are triggered if the ratio is beyond the appropriate range.

Testing/Sampling:

SC V.1 NO_x testing and V.2 CO testing. The facility tested in 2012 and met limits of the ROP. Ranges were set for the water to fuel ratio. Next testing should take place in 2017.

Monitoring/Record Keeping:

SC VI.1 continuously monitor and record the fuel and water injection flows by volume for each unit. The facility continuously monitors and records the fuel and water flows. Monitors were viewed and printouts are attached of the operating conditions. It is also on the End of Run Summary, provided.

SC VI.2 continuously calculate and record the water to fuel ratio, by volume for each unit. The water to fuel ratio is kept continuously. The ratio can be seen on the screen shots from the monitors, as well on the End of Summary Report.

SC VI.3 shall record hours of operation for each calendar month. Hours are tracked and were viewed on site. The hours are also recorded and submitted quarterly.

SC VI.4 shall calculate the annual capacity factor for the facility each year. The annual capacity factor is calculated and was provided when requested (see SC III.2).

SC VI.5 shall monitor and record natural gas usage on an hourly and monthly basis for each turbine unit. Natural gas records are maintained and were viewed – a portion of the records are attached.

SC VI.6 shall monitor and record the operating load with associated water to fuel ratio for each turbine unit. The operating load is continuously monitored and recorded. The units will not operate above 33.5 MW, as that is the load used when the water to fuel ratio was established during testing.

SC VI.7 shall calculate and record the NOx and CO emissions on an hourly, monthly and 12 month rolling basis. NOx and CO are calculated and recorded. A portion of the records is attached. 12 month rolling for NOx is 14.391 tons, for CO is 14.865 tons.

SC VI.8 shall analyze fuel burned in FGCOMBTURB. Fuel is sent for analysis – results provided.

SC VI.9 – VI.13 – CAM conditions – As mentioned in the Regulatory Summary Section of this report, EUCOMBTURB1, EUCOMBTURB2, EUCOMBTURB3, and EUCOMBTURB4 are subject to CAM for their NOx limit in parts per million (SC I.1). Each emission unit uses water injection to lower the temperature which in turn lowers NOx emissions. The facility uses a ratio of water injection to fuel burned as an indicator that the control is operating properly. CAM requires continuous monitoring of fuel consumption and water injection, as well as the calculation of water to fuel ratio, to demonstrate proper operation of the control. The ratios ranges are determined during stack testing for each turbine every 5 years. The ratio is different for each unit. The facility submits reports on excursions or exceedances, excess emissions and monitor downtimes as required. These reports are reviewed as they are received.

Reporting:

The facility reports required reporting on time. The facility chooses to submit CAM reporting on a quarterly basis although only needed semi-annually.

Stacks:

Each turbine unit has a stack with minimum height requirements of 39 feet, and maximum exhaust dimensions of 258.8 x 145.2 inches. The stacks have not been modified and based on visual estimation, appear to meet this specifications.

Other Requirements:

SC IX.1 – continuous compliance plan. The facility has a Continuous Compliance Plan updated and approved by AQD in May of 2015. The plan includes water to fuel ratio ranges, and will need to be updated following the 2017 stack test to reflect the new ranges for each turbine unit.

SC IX.2-9 – these conditions refer to CSPAR, acid rain. As mentioned previously, CAIR was replaced by CSPAR. The facility is responsible for working with US EPA for compliance.

SC IX.10 – 11 – update CAM plan and comply with CAM. The facility submits CAM reports as required and has a CAM Plan dated May 2015.

SC IX.12 – comply with New Source Performance Standards for Stationary Gas Turbines promulgated in 40 CFR, Part 60, Subparts A and GG. The facility appears to be in compliance with GG, no information has come forward to indicate otherwise.

COMPLAINTS

There have been no complaints reported for this facility in past fiscal year. No complaints are noted at all in MACES.

MAERS

MAERS was submitted and reviewed separately. There were no issues.

COMPLIANCE

This facility appears to be in good operating condition during both visits. During operation there were no visible emissions or odors. The facility appears to be in compliance with MI-ROP-N1266-2015 and all applicable requirements.

NAME Becky Radulski

DATE 9/15/16

SUPERVISOR

